

EDMONTON TRANSIT SYSTEM ADVISORY BOARD
MEETING #2, FEBRUARY 24, 2014
HERITAGE ROOM, CITY HALL

PRESENT: Shannah Sutherland, Christopher Dulaba, Gordon Smith, Izak Roux, Bruce Robertson, Amy Mannix, John Hayes, John Vandenberg (partial), Leanne Landry, Vaughan Hoy, Anand Pye, Cristina Stasia (partial),

REGRETS: Steve Bradshaw (ATU 569)

ETS AND CITY STAFF: Troy Shewchuk (Acting Director, Research, Revenue and Expenditure Control), Victoria Luxton (Recording Secretary)

1. CALL TO ORDER

- V. Hoy called the meeting to order at 5:30 pm.

2. BOARD ELECTIONS FOR 2014 (T. SHEWCHUK)

- T. Shewchuk advised members on the available elected positions, and roles of Chair and Deputy Chair.

MOVED: _____ by B. Robertson/A. Pye to nominate and approve T. Shewchuk to administer the elections. **CARRIED**

Motion
Approved

MOVED: _____ by J. Hayes/A. Pye to nominate and approve L. Landry to administer the elections in place of S. Bradshaw. **CARRIED**

Motion
Approved

Chair Election

- T. Shewchuk called for nominations for the Chair of ETS Advisory Board for 2014.

NOMINATED: B. Robertson nominated I. Roux
J. Hayes nominated A. Mannix

Further nominations were called twice.

NOMINATED: V. Hoy nominated B. Robertson

Further nominations were called three times.

No further nominations.

I. Roux agreed to let his name stand.

A. Mannix declined having her name stand.

B. Robertson agreed to let his name stand.

I. Roux and B. Robertson both addressed the Board.

CARRIED: _____ By secret ballot B. Robertson is elected Chair of the ETS Advisory Board for the 2014 term.

Motion
Approved

MOVED: _____ by A. Pye/S. Sutherland to destroy the ballots. **CARRIED**

Deputy Chair Election

- T. Shewchuk called for nominations for the Deputy Chair of ETS Advisory Board for 2014.

NOMINATED: C. Dulaba nominated I. Roux
L. Landry nominated A. Mannix
V. Hoy nominated C. Dulaba

Further nominations were called twice.

NOMINATED: J. Hayes nominated A. Pye

Further nominations were called three times.

No further nominations

I. Roux agreed to let his name stand.

A. Mannix agreed to let her name stand.

C. Dulaba declined having his name stand.

A. Pye agreed to let his name stand.

A. Pye, I. Roux and A. Mannix addressed the Board.

CARRIED: _____ By secret ballot, A. Mannix is elected Deputy Chair of the ETS
Advisory Board for the 2014 term.

Motion
Approved

MOVED: _____ by V. Hoy/J. Hayes to destroy the ballots. **CARRIED**

MOVED: _____ by A. Pye/J. Hayes to return the acting Chair to the newly elected Chair.
CARRIED

Motion
Approved

- T. Shewchuk returned the chair duties to B. Robertson.

Motion
Approved

3. AGENDA REVIEW (B. ROBERTSON)

- The following items were added to the agenda under Item 7 - Information Section:
 - Update from the February 5, 2014 Smart Fare Collection Equipment Report TC Meeting.

MOVED: _____ by L. Landry/J. Hayes to approve the February 24, 2014 amended agenda.
CARRIED

Motion
Approved

4. APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 27, 2014 MINUTES

- Add A. Mannix's name to Long Term Fare Strategy Committee on Page 1 – A. Mannix.
- Add A. Pye's name to the Transit Modalities Committee on Page 1 – A. Pye.
- Change S. Shannah to S. Sutherland on Page 2 under first motion – S. Sutherland.
- Change Projects for 2013 to 2014 – Item 6 on Page 2 – C. Dulaba.
- Delete "between the two parties" under Item 5 on Page 2 – A. Mannix.

MOVED: by V. Hoy/I. Roux to approve the amended January 27, 2014 minutes.

CARRIED

Motion
Approved

5. MANAGER'S REPORT (T. SHEWCHUK)

• Highlights:

- The two reports that are attached to the Manager's report:
 - 1) ETS Smart Fare Collection Equipment
 - 2) Review of Fare Structure for Public Transit Services.

• Questions/Answers

- *(AM) The Stadium Station escalators are down again? (VH) It is impossible to go up the stairs to catch your train when the passengers are coming down the stairs after getting off the train? (SS) Century Park has the same problem when the escalator is down there is no way to get on and off the escalator. (JH) The escalator exiting width is not set up for the escalator to be used both up and down. Stadium, Coliseum, Century Park and Southgate escalators have a design flaw with the platform being so narrow. The elevators are a slow lift and cannot accommodate a lot of passengers. (TS) There is a contract between OTIS and the City and there are ongoing issues with the maintenance schedules, parts and costs of those escalators at Stadium LRT Station. T. Shewchuk will update the members with more information. As for the design this is something for the Board to consider when you are completing the amenities tour(s).*

6. ETSAB PRIORITY PROJECTS FOR 2013

• Marketing Standing Committee (C. Stasia)

- This committee met with two representatives from ETS administration, A. Hill and P. Bhasin-Singh on Monday, February 3, 2014. A. Hill and P. Bhasin-Singh showed the group images that were mocked up which really impressed C. Stasia and A. Mannix. The representatives took C. Stasia's advice in getting away from stock images and they used C. Stasia's suggestion to use instagrams. The two representatives were really enthusiastic and plan to meet with this committee again in the near future and involve ETSAB.

• Long Term Fare Strategy (J. Vandenbeld)

- The subcommittee met on February 12 to determine the content for a draft outline of the low-income transit passes final report, which was presented to the board at this meeting. The outline and recommendations are based on best practice research, statistical data, and sub-committee discussion. Two Appendixes were presented alongside the outline: Appendix A – a chart comparing what other analogous Canadian municipalities do with regards to cost and qualifications, and Appendix B – a draft letter of support that we plan to send out to various organizations and community groups expressing their support for the idea of a low-income transit pass.
- Rational for a low-income pass:
 - ❖ The principle of subsidized transit for low-income earners is supported by numerous City materials including the Way We Live, the Way We Move

- and ETS guiding documents.
- ❖ According to Statistics Canada, there are 75,000 Edmontonians living under the low income cut off.
- ❖ These Edmontonians are more reliant on public transportation than the general population and are more acutely sensitive to ETS price increases, based on research data.
- ❖ Since 2007 the price of an adult transit pass has increased from \$59.00 to \$89.00 thus limiting access to work and leisure activities for tens of thousands of people.
- Who Would Qualify:
 - ❖ The sub-committee recommends that the qualifications for the low-income pass be the same as the COE leisure access program.
- How Much the Pass would Cost Citizens?:
 - ❖ The sub-committee recommends that the low-income pass be offered initially as regular monthly fare product and be set initially at \$35.00 – the same price as the current AISH pass. A \$35.00 pass represents a 60% discount over the cost of an ETS adult pass as of February 2014.
- How much would a low-income monthly transit pass cost the City?:
 - ❖ The sub-committee is working on answering this question. This is challenging, as almost every municipality determines cost by simply multiplying discount offered by passes sold. This results in inflated figures, as it assumes that a) all pass holders would buy a full fare pass if given the chance, and b) does not account for new revenue. We note that the City of Calgary reports 4,366 low income registrants as of July 2013. Although our primary motivation for proposing that Edmonton introduce a low-income transit pass is equity, not efficiency, there are several studies that will likely be cited on the final report explaining how a low-income transit pass has actually benefited other municipalities both socially and fiscally.
- The final report will be presented to the Board in March in order for this report to get onto the TC agenda for the middle of April.
- After discussion and questions it appeared that the Board members had no major concerns with the draft report.
- It was decided that any more comments or concerns would be emailed to J. Vandenberg.
- The final report will be available at the March ETSAB meeting.
- Transit Planning (C. Dulaba)
 - C. Dulaba will be writing a summary on some of the key projects this committee was going to look at and further engage in. There has been some discussion through email on P3 funding.
 - V. Hoy made a request of administration to have an updated presentation to the Board on the P3 funding.
- Public Safety and Security (I. Roux)
 - The committee had a meeting last month and the group reviewed the previous longer report and from this report a summary report was compiled.
 - L. Landry stated she liked the summary report but when she read the longer report it bothered her as she rides the LRT every day and has always felt safe when she rides early in the morning and in the early evenings. Your original

document instilled fear but there is a difference between awareness and fear, so the summary report is more to the point.

- J. Vandenberg is supportive of the summary report “as is” and C. Stasia did a good deal of work with Holloback that suggested there is a problem with the perception of security. He thinks that harassment with young women is an unreported problem on the LRT. J. Vandenberg is convinced with C. Stasia’s compelling data that there is a problem but J. Vandenberg likes that the final report took some pains to have more proactive solutions. J. Vandenberg is appreciative of C. Stasia’s work and is very supportive of this report going forward.
- V. Hoy stated this summary report states nothing that is a “Good News” story. He does not think anything should be changed in the report but it is just how the report is introduced.
- G. Smith stated the report did not mention any specific area that you might look at other than making a map or location of the crime. This is quite important because of some specific areas in the City are more vulnerable such as the University area and Whyte Avenue. G. Smith thinks it is important to zero in on the instances, frequency and time of the day. The reporting system should be generated to make it easy for people to turn in a report. It is very difficult to convince other people to speak up on behalf of a harassment problem. There needs to be some publicity in that area because people are reluctant to speak on behalf of some one else.
- I. Roux commented that the committee does not feel comfortable to put statistics in the report where things happen because they do not have enough data.
- A. Pye stated that half of that work was conducted by HollobackAB and that this work should be made public in the report.
- J. Hayes stated that one of the major barriers in getting data is the ability of people to deal with reporting methods. It is often intimidating to walk into a Police Station and make a police report. If we want to be at all representative of the users of this system we have to make the reporting ability as simple and accessible as possible. There was a form that was put out of about four pages to be completed by people and it would be a fairly difficult completion for the people around this table. It was designed for the working poor to complete. One of the reasons you are the working poor is because you are not very good at completing forms, or exams or tests. What ever outreach we do has to be targeted to people that have real difficulty at addressing authority with completing forms. As soon as we make it hard to do we skew the data away from the most vulnerable people in our community. We have to have an interface that is victim friendly, and not just a data creation device. J. Hayes thought that this was an excellent report with very solid work by the Committee but any reporting concerns be done very sensitively.
- S. Sutherland indicated that the reason the committee specified an on-line tool initially was because right now the group could not find any way to report these kinds of incidents unless it was enough of an emergency to call 911. There is not a way to report an incident after it has occurred. So getting a way to report the incident in the first place, is the first step.
- J. Hayes suggested a “report an incident” phone line where the conversation is a recording and the caller does not speak to anyone. This phone is just to report

incidents.

- L. Landry applauds everyone for all the work that was done but remains concerned based on recent history when the media gets a hold of these reports – what is the headline going to be – “ETSAB feels transit is not safe”.
 - There is a meeting scheduled for this group on Tuesday, February 25th at 5:30 pm in Scotia Place, Conference Room B, lower level with ETS Security with a second meeting on Thursday, March 6th at 5:30 pm in Scotia Place, Conference Room B, lower level.
 - A. Mannix said at the meeting tomorrow they will present this report to ETS Security first to see what administration thinks about the report.
 - More discussion followed on the media attention that could circulate around this report.
 - B. Robertson put in a request to T. Shewchuk to look into in-private reporting with a decision being made at the next meeting.
 - I. Roux stated as Chair of this Committee the intent is not to present this summary report in-camera although there is good information that everyone should know about in this report.
 - I. Roux will bring this report back to the Board at their next meeting in March after their meeting with ETS Security.
- Transit Modalities (J. Hayes)
 - This group will meet this month and plan to have a final report in March.

7. **INFORMATION SECTION (B. ROBERTSON)**

- ATU 569 Report (S. Bradshaw)
 - No report.
- Annual Report and Work Plan Draft (B. Robertson)
 - T. Shewchuk advised the Board that OCC needs the completed Annual Report and four attachments by March 14, 2014 in order to submit the report by the deadline of March 31, 2014.
- Updates from Committees, Pre-planned Meeting Dates (B. Robertson)
 - Public Security Committee has pre-planned their meeting dates on Thursdays once per month.
 - B. Robertson asked the other committee chairs to work on their pre-planned meeting dates. V. Luxton can capture these dates and help you with the venues as part of the 2014 Work Plan.
 -
- Approval of 2014 Board Meeting Dates

MOVED: _____ by C. Stasia/S. Sutherland to approve the 2014 ETSAB Board Meeting Dates. _____

Motion
Approved

CARRIED

- Update on Agencies, Boards and Commissions Policy (ABC Policy) (B. Robertson)
 - Comments/Questions:
 - ❖ (JH) T. Shewchuk is there was any opportunity or chance that anything we say will make any difference to the Policy document? (TS) Yes, there is an opportunity for the Board's input at the end of March but how much

input, this is unknown. *(JH) Three years ago ETSAB spent most of the year carefully crafting and thinking this bylaw through. The members probably spent one thousand man hours creating a document letter by letter with great feedback from D. Nowicki. We worked with D. Nowicki only to have some one from the Office of the City Clerk (OCC) come in and say, “we did not use that one, we wrote one for you, here” and the draft bylaw did not include any of the feedback from ETSAB. My personal take is unless there is a real good chance to have some input or unless there is a real chance to have a hill to die on ETSAB should just accept it for information and move on.*

- ❖ (TS) It was determined that OCC is looking for feedback from ETSAB on the Policy and sequentially the Bylaw because six months ago ETSAB did not want to comment on the Bylaw until the Policy was available.
- V. Hoy did not see anything that was a big issue to him, what he did really like about the Bylaw is it was kept real simple, there was a 5(a) and a 5(b) in terms of our roles and responsibilities in our mandate. He liked the advocacy 5(1) that OCC completely opened up to deal with the Capital Regional Board issues which he did not see with the lawyers when he was dealing with this material with D. Nowicki. V. Hoy is fine with it.
- J. Vandenberg stated he wasted a year of his life on this bylaw/policy review and he is not prepared to waste any more time. J. Vandenberg echoes J. Hayes sentiments – this bylaw is not good but ETSAB is not going to change it so let’s just move on.
- A. Mannix stated that after she read the policy it looked fine to her and it covers so many other groups. A. Mannix thinks ETSAB should have some humility to know ETSAB is just one of twenty-five groups.
- B. Robertson brought up Item 9(2) in the Bylaw about electing the Chair of the Board – do we want to comment on that as this Board had a long discussion as it is out of sink with ETSAB’s fiscal year and member appointment.

MOVED: by J. Hayes/J. Vandenberg that within one week of the electronic circulation of the proper proposed ETSAB Bylaw that the Chair be empowered to call a special meeting of ETSAB if feedback from the Board members merits it in his opinion. **CARRIED**

Motion
Approved

- Meeting Rules and Effective Decision Making (B. Robertson)
 - This is a training session given to Board Chairs, Deputy Chairs and Board administration on “Meetings, rules and effective decision-making” with Meeting Mentor and Registered Parliamentarian Eli Mina. Chair and Deputy Chair need to confirm their attendance with the OCC.
- CUTA Spring Conference - June 2014 (T. Shewchuk)
 - T. Shewchuk reported that there are no details with respect to the work shops of the theme of the spring conference, but we know it is a take-away from the last conference. This will be brought forward to the next meeting in March.
- Update from the Smart Fare Report and February 5, 2014 TC Meeting (A. Mannix)
 - The reports went to TC and the reports were approved for information. A. Mannix agrees with some of the sentiments expressed about being very careful

of the messaging. ETSAB should not run away from the media but use them. A lesson learned, ETSAB was able to provide accurate messaging once reporting once ETSAB members were able to get in touch with the media, and when they were able to answer the media's questions. When delayed, knowing media reporters have 3:00 pm deadlines, the media would send out their reports regardless whether they contacted ETSAB or not.

- V. Hoy commented that when V. Hoy, A. Mannix and B. Robertson were front of TC, all the Council members were in attendance, including the Mayor. Councillor Henderson wanted to clarify ETSAB's position because of all the stories coming out of the media, two days ahead, which reflected the Boards negative and dim view. Councillor Nickels spoke to ETSAB saying he really appreciated this document as it was written in lay terms, a simple document.
- A. Mannix stated she was trying to figure out OCC a little more and that it was interesting the Councillors cannot put forward their own motions during the meeting. They must do it seven days before and give notice of the motion. So if ETSAB goes to Council even without lay recommendations the Councillors will not be able to make a decision on it at that meeting. So it is a case of ETSAB having to follow-up.
- A. Mannix would like the Board to consider drafting a one page letter to TC saying, "great meeting, thanks for your feedback, now we would like you to consider this off-peak fare option on weekends."
- S. Sutherland made a suggestion that this letter could be a fast action item. The Chair of this Committee could draft a letter and send it out by email to all members and then ETSAB does not have to go back and have a formal vote on the letter.

MOVED: by C. Stasia/A. Pye to instruct the Chair of Fare Structure and Payment System Committee draft a follow-up fast action letter to the Transportation Committee. **CARRIED**

Motion
Approved

9. TOPIC OF THE NIGHT (A. MANNIX)

- Introduction of ETSAB's new Chair and Deputy Chair and appreciation was extended to ETSAB's out-going Chair and Deputy Chair.

MOVED: by A. Pye/J. Vandenbeld to adjourn the February 24, 2014 ETSAB Meeting at 8:05 pm. **CARRIED**

Motion
Approved

MEETING DATES

January 18, 2014	August 25, 2014
January 27, 2014	September 29, 2014
February 24, 2014	October 27, 2014
March 31, 2014	November 12, 2014 (Wednesday)
April 28, 2014	November 17, 2014 (3 rd Monday)
May 26, 2014	December 15, 2014 (3 rd Monday)
June 23, 2014	January 17, 2015 (Saturday)
July 28, 2014	